

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

UNITED NATIONS
CENTRE FOR TRADE FACILITATION AND ELECTRONIC BUSINESS
(UN/CEFACT)

INTERNATIONAL TRADE PROCEDURES DOMAIN
International Trade Procedures / Programme Development Area

White Paper

Women in Trade Facilitation

SOURCE: White Paper on Women in Trade Facilitation
ACTION: Draft for discussion
STATUS: Draft v 0.2 ¹

¹ Draft v 0.1 was prepared according to conference call on 7 July 2016 and feedbacks sent from the experts.

WOMEN IN TRADE FACILITATION – WHITE PAPER

46
47
48
49
50
51
52
53
54
55
56
57
58
59
60
61
62
63
64
65
66

Draft Outline of the Recommendation on TTFMM

WOMEN IN TRADE FACILITATION

- 1.- Introduction.
- 2.- Reducing inequalities for women in her role of entrepreneurs and the labor market.
 - 2.1.- Gender as a non-income risk of poverty
 - 2.2.- Vulnerabilities of specific groups or situation (widows, maternity,...)
 - 2.3.- Building capacities and empowerment of women in trade facilitation
 - 2.4.- Designing tailored services for women to facilitate trade
- 3.- Women informal cross border trade
- 4.- Repository of policies to reduce gender equalities in trade facilitation versus gender neutral
- 5.- Need to get more data sources about Women:
 - 5.1.- From the creation of new concepts related to women entrepreneurship and women work (paid and unpaid).
 - 5.2.- Trade facilitation metrics for women –
- 6.- New approaches for policy makers and practitioners to facilitate trade for women

Paloma Bernal 14/9/16 12:38
Commentaire:

Paloma Bernal 14/9/16 12:38
Commentaire:

66 | 1.- Introduction.

67
68 This white paper has the aim to identify ways to solve gender inequalities in trade facilitation.
69 As part of UN/CEFACT's strategy, this paper pursue the objective to contribute to achieve
70 the Sustainable Development Goals of United Nations to reduce gender inequalities and
71 empower all women and girls. More specifically, UN/CEFACT is committed to facilitate
72 trade attaining gender equality in the scope of its activities, which are the simplification,
73 standardization and harmonization of procedures and associated information to move goods
74 from seller to buyer and make payment alongside the trade chain.
75

76 In the context of the Trade Facilitation Agreement as a centerpiece of the Bali Package
77 developed by World Trade Organization (WTO), gender disparities reduce the gains that can
78 be achieved in terms of international trade opportunities and country's competitiveness and
79 economic growth. In this regard, WTO, Intracen, UN and The World Bank are shedding
80 some light on the fact that gender equality matters as an instrument for economic
81 development through international trade activities.
82

83 Gender discrimination in trade facilitation has multiple dimensions. The synergies of
84 inequalities that exist in many different areas, multiple sectors and affect a myriad of fields of
85 knowledge that harm the integration of women in international trade. Thus, it is widely
86 recognized that gender inequalities exist in three main areas: women in economy (as
87 entrepreneur and labour force), women in power, and women as a decision maker. There are
88 also distinct barriers for women by sectoral activities and professions involved in the trade
89 chain buy-ship-pay system, such as, marine and air pilots, truck drivers, crane operators,
90 vessel traffic services operatives, stevedores, harbour masters, traders, port managers and
91 customs agents. Also, gender inequalities are trapped in multidisciplinary areas, which need
92 the integration of many fields of knowledge that requires the contribution of lawyers,
93 economists, sociologists, finance experts, statisticians, engineers, doctors, anthropologists,
94 psychologists.
95

96 In a holistic approach, this white paper has twofold goals: reduce gender inequalities in trade
97 procedures but also to facilitate trade to women. In this regard, the scope of this document is
98 not merely the description of the state of the art of women in trade facilitation. More
99 importantly, it sets some guidance to implement a mainstreaming in gender that implies tools,
100 policies and implementation strategies. To achieve these goals, this paper also recognizes the
101 engagement needed to achieve this goal from politicians, managers, recruiters, money
102 lenders, economic advisors, teachers and trainers, and the full society.
103

104 | 2.- Reducing inequalities for women in her role of entrepreneurs and the labour market.

105
106 Women's role in trading activities can be seen under three different perspectives: as
107 producers, traders and entrepreneurs (Brenton, et al. 2013; Higgins 2012) and workers.
108 Despite the huge contribution of women all around the world in trading, gender disparities
109 remain.
110

111 Women are the predominant dealers and marketers of agricultural, aquaculture and artisanal
112 industry in domestic markets, while long-distance trade that involves relatively capital-
113 intensive techniques and higher profit margins, is carried out mainly by men. There are some
114 reasons that are interconnected for gender imbalance: 1) Imbalanced access to assets and
115 resources, such as, capital and land, 2) In developing countries, women has disproportional

116 less access to basic services, such as, water, electricity, basic banking services; 3) lack of
117 access on business development services and skills; 4) Intra-household inequalities.

118
119 In the labour market, as a dependent worker, it is more significant that women cannot
120 contribute to the economy to the fullest extent of their capabilities because of the constraints
121 and barriers that they face. Alongside the supply value chain of any export or import, the
122 access of women to some professions remains insufficient. It means that in countries where
123 the educational gap has been overcome, women have difficulties to access to acquire
124 technical knowledge due to the barriers for their professional development in the labor
125 market. Many professions involved in the buy-ship-pay chain at all level of hierarchy are
126 under the dominance of men (customs, infrastructures, transportation, internal logistics,...).

127
128 This division of labour, as entrepreneur or a worker, reflects deeply entrenched social roles
129 that restrict women's mobility and access to productive resources within the value chain of
130 exports. Women tend to receive "diminished" role in the society based on gender relations,
131 gender roles and some cases gender norms.

132
133 In terms of legal framework, discrimination appears in access to assets (inheritance laws,
134 access to credit and loans,...). The inequities affect women as workers, because there are
135 limitations for accessing to the top levels of work, suffer salary inequalities, requires higher
136 security protection in cross-border activities, and women have difficulties to achieve the
137 professional knowledge. All these facts reduce the number of women that participate in
138 activities related to trade facilitation as traders, cross border management, transportation,
139 logistics chain management, infrastructures, ICT, advisory services, etc.

140
141 Law level of education and illiteracy are factors harm women enormously to success in
142 micro-business. Indeed, in many African countries women make a major contribution
143 through their involvement in the production of goods, as cross-border traders and as
144 managers and owners of firms involved in trade. It has been estimated that the goods that
145 female farmers produce have enormous potential for increased trade between African
146 countries and with the global market (Brenton et al. 2013). The experience acquired in
147 specific programs developed by international organizations (Intracen, The World Bank,
148 UNESCAP, etc) guiding women in improving production techniques; training them about
149 organic certification, standards development, and international trading are having an
150 enormous success in increasing exports and lead women to achieve higher income
151 opportunities. But also in the labor market specific training programs are required to provide
152 the skills and attain access for women in international trade.

153
154 [2.1.- Gender as a non-income risk of poverty](#)

155
156 The gender dimensions of poverty were becoming more prominent in development policy
157 debates from th 1970s and especially since the First World Conference on Women in Mexico
158 City in 1975 that put the relevance that just being a woman implies a higher risk of being
159 poor. Traditionally inequalities has been analyzed by economist as the GDP development gap
160 among countries, which gap has been reduced significantly since 1950 (Milanovic). But at
161 the microlevel perspective, inequalities within regions, neighbourhoods and interpersonal
162 inequalities.

163

164 Achieving gender equality, is key to realizing human development. Very often is defended
165 the argument of the role of women in the economic growth. It is aptly stressed that
166 « economic growth, increases by international trade and investments and technological
167 advance ». They all are very important. But they are means, not ends. The main objective
168 expand people's choices, whether they help create an environment for people, men and
169 women to develop their full potential and lead productive and creative lives.

170

171 Viewed from this perspective, gender equality will advance human development and in so
172 doing, will also contribute to the development and efficiency of the whole economy by
173 allowing women to develop their full potential.

174

175 2.2.- Vulnerabilities of specific groups or situation (widows, maternity, illiteracy...)

176

177 Women represent a large proportion of the workers in the informal economy. They are
178 assuming increasing roles as owners and managers of SMEs but face routine discrimination
179 when applying for finance or Government support. Their vulnerability increased with the
180 recent global economic crisis, as when formal sector workers switch to the informal economy
181 during crises, it depresses the wages of the informal economy. As a result, women are
182 considered as part of the "flexible" workforce that can be easily discarded during economic
183 downturns. Inclusive trade policies therefore need to include gender appropriate measures
184 and specifically target export-oriented enterprises which are owned or managed by women.
185 Women entrepreneurship needs to be promoted and access to credit, including micro-credit
186 should proceed on a non-discriminatory basis.

187

188 Culturally maternity, especially non-married women, and the marital status, especially
189 widows and single women, discriminate women from the social and professional life. They
190 are neglected of being economically dependant of the oldest sons, sisters, and mothers.

191 Women are disadvantaged in terms of literacy and education. Illiteracy, lack of information
192 and knowledge about cross-border trade regulations and procedures impede women to benefit
193 from the trade and border management reforms if they are ignorant of them. Moreover,
194 women sometimes do not have much knowledge of rules and regulations regarding the taxes
195 and import fees. For example, one year after the East African Community (EAC) Customs
196 Union had become operational, cross-border women traders were not aware of it and were
197 still using illegal routes to trade goods across borders, unaware that some of the goods they
198 were trading were not taxed (Higgins 2012). The lack of knowledge about rights and
199 obligations in trade and illiteracy put women in the risk of being exploited, assaulted with
200 gender-based violence, or being victim of corruptive practices from government officers
201 (Brenton, et al. 2013, Higgins 2012, Wrigley-Asante 2013). Female cross border traders are
202 forced to pay larger bribes than male traders or must provide sexual favors to avoid detention
203 or goods confiscation by border officials.

204

205 2.3.- Building capacities and empowerment of women in trade facilitation

206

207 The limitations that women have to acquire assets (such land) affect their access to credit and
208 inputs. These barriers not only mean inefficiencies in the use of land, natural resources and raw
209 materials also, they are translated into economic inefficiencies and less trade. In terms of trade
210 facilitation, gender inequalities exists in building enough skills for women to reduce barriers in trade
211 and to empower women in international trade activities.

212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239
240
241
242
243
244
245
246
247
248
249
250
251
252
253
254
255
256
257
258
259
260
261

To build human capital and empower women to take up international business opportunities must be not limited to the achievement of enough technical knowledge to drafting export development plans, developing marketing strategies and conducting market research, which it is indeed crucial. More contributions in women trade support come from technical assistance programs that help to upgrade and diversify exports opportunities for women.

Constraints arise from the interplay of formal institutions and markets, in which the involvement of women in the trade community is very low. Thus, the increase of participation of women in the consultation process between traders and governments could bring a lot of opportunities for women. First, it should help to reduce inefficiencies by improving information access for women about import and export procedures, procedures of border agencies, examples of customs classification, and formalities in procedures and documentation. Second, it will help to contribute to build social and economic networking for women providing knowledge, experience and monitoring mechanisms, which could help other international women entrepreneurs to trade successfully. Third, reinforcing the role of women in the tandem of institutions and markets could reduce some gender gaps, such as:

- a) it bring trade openness and the diffusion of new information, contributing to economic empowerment of women
- b) it could help to reduce transaction costs associated with access to markets and services for women, such as, the easiness of doing business
- c) it will help to reduce barriers for women in international trade activities, improving the cooperation with customs authorities, neighbouring and third countries, and providing a better understanding about rules and process applied in trading internationally for specific products.

But gender constraints are not limited to operational barriers to export and import, it comes also for women's underrepresentation in occupations related to trade, such as transportation, customs authorities, border agencies, etc, especially in those positions that implies managerial roles in trade. Lack of representation of women in public institutions related to trade, such as, ministries, chambers of commerce, industrial associations, national trade committees, and standards and technical committees is not only a barrier to addressing discrimination in labor markets, it also limits the mechanisms to design policies that addresses gender gaps in international trade.

Mention standards and certification (not evidence of women labour force importance in certification) – related about bribe

Women's time maternity

2.4.- Designing tailored services for women to facilitate trade

Female entrepreneurs face obstacles during the start-up process and while running the business. Most women-owned enterprises do not get financial support from banks at the start-up stage, the majority of women rely on reinvested profit and proper savings (WIGB-UNIMELB 2015). Women have limited access to bank loans due to the lack of collateral. Discrimination in access to finance restricts the growth of women-owned firms and forces them to remain in the informal sector. Studies indicate that female entrepreneurs have less access to credit from banks and financial institutions than their male counterparts (Babbitt, et al. 2015). Moreover, women entrepreneurs in rural areas have problems accessing banking services. In most rural areas, banking infrastructure is non-existent which forces women to

262 travel to cities to conduct banking transactions. Besides being a long and time-consuming
263 process, travelling with cash entails risks. This results in muggings, theft and deaths
264 (UNCTAD 2014).

265

266 New financial products must be developed and new methods to measure risks should be more
267 broadly implemented to help women to access a broader range of financial services, reduce
268 credit barriers in international trade and assist credit takers and women in particular. There is
269 a need to create new instruments to support and extend credit services to female-owned
270 business and female international business for improving the functioning of credit and
271 improving the financial accessibility for women. The design of new credit instruments for
272 women is crucial to reduce the spiral effects of high informality and the limited access to
273 assets for women. Traditionally, credits are linked to the credit history and the warranty of
274 assets to secure credits. The new financial instruments to increase formal credit accessibility
275 for women linked to the cash flow and business opportunities, instead of being linked to
276 assets, are starting to be a successful and real solution to this trade barrier (Access Bank in
277 Nigeria, DFCU in Uganda, Sero Lease and Finance in Tanzania). ITC worked with financial
278 services providers to develop a loan for any client with a productive activity, with minimal
279 documentation requirements and flexible collateral (ITC 2015).

280

281 More services for women: information technologies, transport
282 Travel impediments for women, insecurity (for the goods and women)
283 Technical assistance – standards barriers

284

285 [3.- Women informal cross border trade](#)

286

287 In many cases women trade internationally without register their business. Informal women
288 business are particularly abundant in impoverished regions. Informality hamper business
289 growth since it brings difficulties to access to loans and financial services and fully develop
290 their business in the markets. (Kistruck, 2015). Prior research has suggested such a large
291 percentage of entrepreneurs elect not to formally register their ventures in Base-of-the-
292 Pyramid BOP markets because the institutional environment in such settings is ‘weak’ (De
293 Soto, 2000; North, 1990). Moreover, the government imposes high regulatory barriers to
294 establish a firm, which pushes women into the informal sector (Babbitt, et al. 2015).

295

296 As long as economic transactions are not systematically recorded, most female trading
297 activities are invisible to the government and policy-makers. Thus, trade policies and
298 institutions neglect this segment of trade and do not offer the support informal traders need
299 (Brenton, et al. 2013; Njikam and Tchouassi 2010).

300

301 Informal cross border trade (ICBT) in East Africa is likely to be several times larger than
302 officially documented trade flows. It is known that seventy percent of informal cross border
303 traders in the Southern Africa region are women (UN WOMEN 2010). Women informal
304 cross border traders (WICBT) make a significant contribution to economic growth,
305 government revenues and food security, bringing food products to areas where the products
306 are in short supply (Brenton, et al. 2013). The UNIFEM baseline studies showed that
307 women’s trading activities contribute to poverty reduction, employment and wealth creation

308 (Ndiaye 2010). Moreover, the proceeds from the trading activities form the main source of
309 household income for three out of every four of these traders (Brenton, et al. 2013).

310

311 Women are forced into informal trade because of the barriers they face. Among the factors
312 that encourage traders to participate in informal trade are: multiple taxation of goods, and
313 delays in processing export documents. Several conducted researches showed that WICBT
314 also face problems like multiple control posts, limited transport capacities and high transport
315 costs, poor infrastructure and storage, limited access to formal credit. Women traders face
316 particular constraints at customs and border management. Lack of recognition and
317 transparency, invisibility, weak governance and control for monitoring abuse and corruption
318 at the border lead to verbal and sexual abuse, extortion, violence, physical harassment, rape,
319 imprisonment, stigmatization and confiscation of goods.

320

321 Further, women are disadvantaged in terms of literacy and education. Lack of information
322 and knowledge about cross-border trade regulations and procedures prevent women from
323 taking full advantage of the opportunities created by trade. Several researches showed that
324 women cannot benefit from the trade and border management reforms if they are ignorant of
325 them. Moreover, women sometimes do not have much knowledge of rules and regulations
326 regarding the taxes and import fees. For example, one year after the East African Community
327 (EAC) Customs Union had become operational, cross-border women traders were not aware
328 of it and were still using illegal routes to trade goods across borders, unaware that some of
329 the goods they were trading were not taxed (Higgins 2012). Due to lack of knowledge about
330 rights and obligations women are affected in the form of corruption and exploitation and
331 gender-based violence (Brenton, et al. 2013, Higgins 2012). Low levels of literacy lead to
332 situations when women traders are demanded to make both official and unofficial payments
333 to government officials (Wrigley-Asante 2013). Female cross border traders are forced to pay
334 larger bribes than male traders or must provide sexual favors to avoid detention or goods
335 confiscation by border officials.

336

337

338 [4.- Repository of policies to reduce gender equalities in trade facilitation versus gender neutral](#)

339 [HERE CAN HAVE BENCHMARKING AND BEST PRACTICES](#)

340

341 [5.- Need to get more data sources about Women:](#)

342 Introduction paragraph. Volunteer Paloma

343

344 [5.1.- From the creation of new concepts related to women entrepreneurship and women work \(paid](#)
345 [and unpaid\).](#)

346

347 If the activity developed by women is within the informal sector socially and economically
348 there is not a recognition of the value added with the work done by women. In developing
349 countries, access to water is provided by the work executed by women, not only to feed
350 families also as a basic resource for small artisanal industries as clay, agriculture, and apparel
351 industry. New concepts are needed to separate paid and unpaid women work, to accurate
352 account the female labour force.

353

354 If the activity developed by women is within the formal sector, the creation and measurement
355 of new concepts are needed not only to record women entrepreneurship or runned by women,
356 but also to measure the trade facilitation components for women. It would be extremely
357 useful to produce standard definitions and criteria for key terms (e.g. "woman-owned
358 enterprise" and "woman-managed enterprise") and then identify indicators and data to be
359 collected in order to monitor/evaluate women's participation in trade and the trade barriers
360 that they face.

362 UN-women consultation in création of this concepts

364 5.2.- Trade facilitation metrics for women –

365 Transportation for women (organizations)

367 6.- New approaches for policy makers and practitioners to facilitate trade for women

368
369 It is time to recognize and expand the acknowledge of the formal policies already designed to
370 protect the rights of women in the labour market, economic development, trade and trade
371 facilitation.

372
373 However a decoupling effect is sticked between the policies already designed to protect women
374 rights and the application of these policies that hamper the reduction of gender gaps that still exist
375 (Cahill, 1997). New instruments, theories and methodologies must be applied in the field of
376 economics to recognize the role of women in trade and empower women in trade facilitation. The
377 application of the theories in social behaviour and psychology could reduce the gender blindness and
378

379 Awareness of the potential of women, implementation plans

382 References

383
384 Brenton, P., Gamberoni, E., & Catherine, S., 2013. Women and Trade in Africa: Realizing the
385 Potential. The World Bank. Available at : <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/bitstream/handle/10986/16629/825200WP0Women00Box379865B00PUBLIC0.pdf?sequence=1>

387
388 Higgins, K., 2012. Gender Dimensions of Trade Facilitation and Logistics, A Guidance Note. Eds.
389 The World Bank; Available at http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTRANETTRADE/Resource/s/Pubs/Gender_Dimensions_Trade_Facilitation_Logistics_Higgins_electronic.pdf

391
392 Kistruck, G. M.; Webb, J.W.; Sutter, C.J.; Bailey, A.V.G., 2015. *The double-edged sword of*
393 *legitimacy in base-of-the-pyramid markets*. *Journal of Business Venturing*, 30: 436–451.

394
395