

Original text	Suggested text	By	Amended text	Comments
When working towards the realization of these principles, consultation with stakeholders is an important stepping stone.	When working towards the realization of these principles, Consultation across government agencies and public participation of stakeholders is an important condition for realizing these principles	BV	When working towards the realization of these principles, Consultation across government agencies and public participation of stakeholders is an important condition	Accepted in part
Legislators and government agencies will find that the expertise and experience of the companies and organizations that work in the field is an invaluable source of information <b>and expertise</b> for designing appropriate and suitable solutions and <b>approaches</b> for trade facilitation.	Legislators and government agencies will find that the expertise and experience of the companies and organizations that work in the field is an invaluable source of information for designing appropriate and suitable solutions for trade facilitation.	AS	Legislators and government agencies will find that the expertise and experience of the companies and organizations that work in the field is an invaluable source of information for designing appropriate <b>approaches</b> and suitable solutions for trade facilitation.	Expertise accepted Approaches are different from solutions – possibly reversed order.
Trade will find that taking part in consultation gives them an opportunity to voice their concerns and ideas, build understanding for the conditions of trade and be prepared in time for changes in practice or legislation.	Trade will find that taking part in consultation gives them an opportunity to voice their concerns and proposals for improvement and build understanding for the conditions of trade. It will also help them to be prepared in time for changes in practice or legislation.	AS	Trade will find that taking part in consultation gives them an opportunity to voice their concerns and proposals for improvement and build understanding for the conditions of trade. It will also help <b>trade</b> to be prepared in time for changes in practice or legislation.	We don't understand why this would be too vast. It states the evident benefits to trade. Language accepted.
Although the importance of consultation has long been	Although the importance of consultation has long been	AS	Although the importance of consultation has long been	Accepted with language changes

**Commentaire [ASB1]:** I erase it because is a repetition of the word expertise

**Commentaire [ASB2]:** For me this is too vast, does not really say anything. We could find something more specific.

recognized, experience show that concrete methodologies and best practices are needed to ensure real consultation.	recognized, experience show that putting into place concrete methodologies and best practices is necessary to ensure effective consultation		recognized, experience <b>shows</b> that establishing concrete methodologies and best practices is needed to ensure effective consultation	
Even when consultative structures and the laws providing for participation are put in place, measures have to be taken to ensure a transparent and accountable dialogue, a change of mindset /culture and strengthening of the capacity of public agencies and private sector to participate.	Even when consultation is granted by law and supported by existing consultative procedures, measures have to be taken to ensure a transparent and accountable dialogue.	AS	Even when consultation is granted by law and supported by existing consultative procedures, measures have to be taken to ensure a transparent and accountable dialogue that takes into consideration the differences in mindset and culture as well as the capacity of public and private sector agencies to participate.	Language accepted but the two notions concepts culture and capacity is a key element
Transparency is often defined as XXX. For the purposes of consultation an operative definition would be to define transparency as an iterative process that is, participatory, collaborative and responsive to all impacted stakeholders. Continuous engagement in such a process (that is, a process that is on-going and on a	Transparency is often defined as XXX the process that ensure the availability for information and simplifying the customs regulations and procedure requirements in international trade transactions. For the purposes of consultation an operative definition would be to define transparency as an iterative process that allows stakeholders to participate in the	PBT	In the context of consultations, transparency is key to meaningful dialogue. Transparency here can be defined as the early availability to information by impacted stakeholders such that they can participate in the elaboration, adoption or implementation of procedural requirements or trade facilitation measures. For the purposes of	

**Commentaire [ASB3]:** Real is to vague., Maybe efficient consultation

	continuum, as opposed to a singular event) will foster a critical tool in maintaining an open dialogue between all parties and will ensure the development of trade policy that is beneficial and acceptable to both government and trade.	elaboration, adoption or implementation of procedural requirements or trade facilitation policies in order to ensure their predictability and simplification (iterative process that is, participatory, collaborative and responsive to all impacted stakeholders).		consultation a transparent dialogue is an iterative process that is, participatory, collaborative and responsive to all impacted stakeholders. Continuous engagement in such a process (that is, a process that is on-going and on a continuum, as opposed to a singular event) will ensure the development of trade policy that is beneficial and acceptable to both government and trade.	
In the context of consultations, transparency is key to meaningful dialogue. Transparency here can be defined as the early availability to information by impacted stakeholders such that they can participate in the elaboration, adoption or implementation of procedural requirements or trade facilitation measures. For the purposes of consultation a transparent dialogue is an iterative process that is, participatory,	<b>In the context of consultations, a transparent and accountable dialogue can be defined as an iterative process that is, inclusive, participatory, collaborative and responsive to all impacted stakeholders.</b> <b>Continuous</b> engagement in such a process is essential to ensure the development of trade policy that is beneficial and acceptable to both government and trade.	AS	In the context of consultations, a transparent and accountable dialogue can be defined as an iterative process that <b>begins with the early availability of information for all stakeholders and provides that engagement on a continuum, as opposed to a singular event, thereby establishing a process that is inclusive, participatory, collaborative and responsive to all impacted stakeholders.</b> <b>This is essential to ensuring the</b>	The comments on this part has been worked on at different times and as a result this table gives different starting texts for AS comments.  Language comments taken into account.	<p><b>Commentaire [ASB4]:</b> We can not have both sentences (previous and this one) because in the context of consultations and for the purposes of consultations is the same.</p> <p><b>Commentaire [ASB5]:</b> Is this the definition of transparency? I would rather say that is a process that is known and inclusive. It sounds to me rather as the definition of meaningful dialogue rather than transparency</p> <p><b>Commentaire [ASB6]:</b> I suggest a shorter version of this sentence</p>

<p>collaborative and responsive to all impacted stakeholders. Continuous engagement in such a process (that is, a process that is on-going and on a continuum, as opposed to a singular event) will ensure the development of trade policy that is beneficial and acceptable to both government and trade.</p>			<p>development of trade policy that is beneficial and acceptable to both government and trade.</p>	
	<p>With the Recommendation No 4, <i>National Trade Facilitation Bodies</i>, UNECE recognized the importance of private and public sector consultation and called for the establishment of so-called PRO organizations as its vehicle</p>	BV		<p>Rejected. Will possibly need a special box but comes too early – we are talking to a new audience here and need to get their attention, not linking to ourselves.</p>
<p>Legislators and government agencies will find that the expertise and experience of the companies and organizations that work in the field is an invaluable source of information and expertise for designing appropriate and suitable solutions and approaches for trade facilitation.</p>	<p><i>"The needs of all parties, both private and public sectors, must be identified before solutions can be found and those best placed to explain their needs are those directly involved in the transaction chain. This requires an effective forum where private sector managers, public-sector administrators and policy makers can work together</i></p>	BV	<p><i>The needs of all parties, both private and public sectors, must be identified before solutions can be found and those best placed to explain their needs are those directly involved in the transaction chain.</i></p>	<p>Accepted but after the deleted sentence. The deletion is not accepted. The deleted sentence gives a necessary overview. The last part leads us to fixed organisations which is not the scope for this recommendation.</p>

	<i>towards the effective implementation of jointly-agreed facilitation measures.”</i>			
Trade will find that taking part in consultation gives them an opportunity to voice their concerns and ideas, build understanding for the conditions of trade and be prepared in time for changes in practice or legislation.	<i>“The needs of all parties, both private and public sectors, must be identified before solutions can be found and those best placed to explain their needs are those directly involved in the transaction chain. This requires an effective forum where private sector managers, public-sector administrators and policy makers can work together towards the effective implementation of jointly-agreed facilitation measures.”</i>	BV	Trade will find that taking part in consultation gives them an opportunity to voice their concerns and ideas, build understanding for the conditions of trade and be prepared in time for changes in practice or legislation. <i>The needs of all parties, both private and public sectors, must be identified before solutions can be found and those best placed to explain their needs are those directly involved in the transaction chain.</i>	The forum part of this goes towards fixed organisations again. The rest accepted but in new order
Although the importance of consultation has long been recognized, experience show that concrete methodologies and best practices are needed to ensure real consultation.	But although the importance of consultation has long been recognized and institutional bodies such as PRO Committees set up in many countries, experience with these consultative bodies/approaches have shown mixed results.	BV	Although the importance of consultation has long been recognized, experience show that concrete methodologies and best practices are needed to ensure real consultation.	Not accepted – cannot be said to governments
To that end, although setting up, for instance, a PRO-organization, as described in the	Even when governments have set up, for instance, a PRO-organization, as described in the	AS	Even when governments have set up, for instance, a PRO-organization, as described in the	Accepted in shorter version

UNECE Recommendation No 4, <i>National Trade Facilitation Bodies</i> , can be one important organizational set-up for consultation and transparency, a. collaborative consultation approach must first be established as the foundation of such an organization, to safeguard its success.	UNECE Recommendation No 4, <i>National Trade Facilitation Bodies</i> , its success will depend on the establishment of a <b>collaborative</b> consultation approach within the organization.		UNECE Recommendation No 4, <i>National Trade Facilitation Bodies</i> , its success will depend on the establishment of a collaborative consultation approach	
	Effective public-private consultation requires an enabling environment. Experience shows that a favorable legislation <sup>1</sup> , clear procedures, transparency <sup>2</sup> and continuity are enabling conditions.	BV	Effective public-private consultation requires an enabling environment. Experience shows that a favorable legislation, clear procedures, transparency and continuity are enabling conditions.	Accepted Footnotes should be deleted or incorporated into the text at a later stage.
	Only by taking the time to understand the specific needs and pain points of the different parties can a consultation approach based on trust and collaboration be built.	BV		
	Given this	BV		Rejected

5 <sup>1</sup> such as statutory or constitutional duties for enabling public participation in the policy and rulemaking process, and

6 <sup>2</sup> Transparent consultation process means that the government and consulted parties have a clear understanding of the content of the consultation, the procedures and mechanisms, the parties consulted, and the factors that influence the decision making (derived from COM(2002)704. General principles and Minimum standards for consultation of interested parties by the Commission).

	background it seems timely to review country experiences with a view to generate recommendations on general principles and best practices			
The rest of the Introduction	Deletion	BV		Rejected
The trade must be willing to coalesce the issues that need to be brought forward to government for discussion. Government must also identify critical issues that need to be brought before the trade, as well as providing the process by which these issues can be discussed identifying impacted stakeholders (including other government agencies), and providing timely opportunity for consultation.	Trade must be willing to coalesce the issues that need to be brought forward to government for discussion. Government must also identify critical issues that need to be brought before Trade. They are the ones to provide the process by which these issues can be discussed, identify impacted stakeholders (including other government agencies), and provide a timely opportunity for consultation.	AS	Trade must be willing to coalesce the issues that need to be brought forward to government for discussion. Government must also identify critical issues that need to be brought before trade, as well as providing the process by which these issues can be discussed. This includes identifying impacted stakeholders (including other government agencies), and providing timely opportunity for consultation.	Accepted but sentence divided at other point.
This recommendation addresses issues such as information sharing, preparations necessary before consultations, and measures that aim at building a trust-based dialogue. Where available, best practices in the field of	This recommendation aims at facilitating transparent, fair, accountable and participatory consultation processes. It addresses issues such as information sharing, preparations necessary before consultations, and measures that aim at building a trust-	AS	The purpose of this recommendation is to advise governments and the business community on how to approach effective consultations that will be transparent, fair, accountable and participatory. This recommendation addresses issues	Accepted in part.

**Commentaire [ASB8]:** This sentence was too long, so I cut it

consultation are provided.	based dialogue. Where available, best practices in the field of consultation are provided		such as information sharing, preparations necessary before consultations, and measures that aim at building a trust-based dialogue. Where available, best practices in the field of consultation are provided.	
Preparations before consultations are necessary to foster a collaborative culture and achieve concrete results. The preparations may be different in nature depending on whether the party concerned is, for instance, a government agency, a traders' association or a chamber of commerce, but there are best practice processes that will be recurrent in most of these preparations.	Deletion	AS/BV		Rejected. What would be the rationale for deletion? Should it be moved elsewhere? We need more information and discussion.
NEW	Benefits of Transparency in Consultation Process 1.- Stakeholders involvement contributes to reduce administrative burdens and reduce costs. 2.- The consultation process build trust	PBT		Rejected. It is unclear if this refers to consultations in general or to transparency. We believe this has been treated elsewhere in the text.

	<p>among participants and the public and private administration.</p> <p>3.- Improves the accessibility of trade-related information, especially, with the use of technologies.</p> <p>4.- Provides structured and comprehensive information with the interaction of the experts.</p> <p>5.- Help to identify and address unintended obstacles to trade.</p> <p>6.- Ensure efficiency and practicability of the results achieved.</p>			
The recommendations on consultation approaches are not limited to a certain media or a certain organizational setup, but are looking to the whole mindset of approaches to consultations	The recommendation on consultation approaches is not limited to a certain media or a certain organizational setup, but are looking to the whole mindset of approaches to consultations. This means that many of the principles described in this recommendation can be applied by <i>National Trade Facilitation Bodies</i> , as for UN/CEFACT Recommendation N°4.	BV	The recommendations on consultation approaches are not limited to a certain media or a certain organizational setup, but are looking to the whole mindset of approaches to consultations, The principles described in this recommendation can be applied to a large number of consultative set-ups, such as informal discussions, focus groups, formal or informal trade facilitation committees or other consultative situations.	Agreed to that there need to be examples given. Rec 4 should be referenced in another way in this paper.
This	This	BV		We wonder if there

<p>recommendation primarily envisages consultations at a national level between key stakeholders in trade and border crossing. However, many of the basic principles and ideas can be transferred both to local, sub-regional and regional levels.</p>	<p>recommendation primarily envisages consultations at national level between key stakeholders in trade and border crossing. However, many of the basic principles and ideas can be transferred both to provincial, and local, as well as, sub-regional and regional levels.</p>			<p>is a real need for clarification. With sub-regional one can mean levels like the EFTA. With regional we mean ASEAN or EU. The interpretation of a region in a country could also be valid.</p>
<p>The recommendations on consultation approaches are not limited to a certain media or a certain organizational setup, but are looking to the whole mindset of approaches to consultations.</p>	<p>The recommendations apply to all stages of the legislative process and to all policy instruments from policy papers to laws and rules and regulations.</p>			
<p>Consultation will provide stakeholders the means by which to voice their viewpoints, clarify issues, and engage in meaningful dialogue.</p>	<p>Deletion</p>	<p>AS</p>		<p>Further explanation regarding the deletion is required. We believe this to be one of the cornerstone principles of what we are trying to get across.</p>
<p>For government and public agencies it provides opportunities to disclose information and solicit feedback on actions taken or to be taken. This will ensure accountability,</p>	<p>For government and public agencies, <b>consultation</b> provides opportunities to disclose information and solicit feedback on actions taken or to be taken. This will ensure accountability,</p>	<p>AS</p>	<p>For government and public agencies <b>consultation</b> provides opportunities to disclose information and solicit feedback on actions taken or to be taken. This will ensure</p>	<p>Accepted. Additional language changes included.</p>

**Commentaire [BV9]:** What is meant by sub-regional and regional?

<p>effectiveness, and improve the quality of decision making. For trade it provides an opportunity to voice opinions and concerns and suggest more cost-effective solutions, while allowing for timely stocktaking of planned legislation or reform and make needed preparations.</p>	<p>effectiveness, and improve the quality of decision making. For trade, it provides an opportunity to voice opinions and concerns and suggest solutions to existing challenges, while allowing for timely stocktaking of planned legislation or reforms and make needed preparations.</p>		<p>accountability, effectiveness, and improve the quality of decision making. For trade it provides an opportunity to voice opinions and concerns and suggest solutions to existing challenges, while allowing for timely preparations for planned legislation or reform.</p>	
<p>This will result in building trust between the parties, increasing transparency in the process, providing industry with the time it needs to prepare for new rules or regulations, promoting successful legislation, and ensuring overall compliance.</p>	<p>Consultation helps building trust between the parties, increasing transparency in the process, promoting successful decision making, and ensuring overall compliance.</p>	<p>AS</p>		<p>Rejected. "This" refers to all concepts in previous paragraph and needs to be kept – consultation alone will not change that. Time to prepare for and adapt to legislation is one of the major advantages of consultations to trade. It is not any decision making that needs to be successful but the actual legislation or similar prepared. Compliance is by trade to the legislation and that is one of the major advantages to government. If trade can adapt to legislation in good time and have an influence on how the legislation is formulated it will more easily comply with it.</p>

**Commentaire [ASB10]:** compliance of who? by who?

Together the parties will be able to find innovative, effective, cost-efficient and simplifying solutions to any issue discussed. In contrast, even simple changes of rules or regulations may encounter problems not considered or anticipated by the legislator without prior consultation with the impacted stakeholders. Such problems can lead to, for instance, longer waiting times at the border, corruption and loss of revenue.	Together the parties will find innovative, effective, cost-efficient and simplifying solutions to any issue discussed. In contrast, even simple changes of rules or regulations may encounter problems not considered or anticipated by the legislator without prior consultation with the impacted stakeholders. Such difficulties can lead to, for instance, longer waiting times at the border, corruption and loss of revenue.	AS		Not accepted – Semantics. The sentence is under condition that the consultations take place in “our way”.
<b>Recommend</b> to governments and trade a consultative approach that fosters trust, transparency and timely dialogue between all stakeholders.	<b>Recommend</b> to governments and trade an iterative consultative approach that fosters trust, transparency and accountable dialogue between all stakeholders.	AS	<b>Recommend</b> to governments and trade a consultative approach that fosters trust, transparency as well as timely and accountable dialogue between all stakeholders.	Accepted with modifications to the text
<b>a focus on</b> the importance of transparency and positive results as a prerequisite for building trust between the parties in consultation.	<b>a focus on</b> the importance of transparency and accountability as prerequisite for building trust between the parties in consultation.	BV		Accepted
<b>the sharing of</b> information on trade facilitation matters and legislative	<b>the sharing of</b> information on trade facilitation matters and legislative	AS		Rejected. “Sharing information” is strong enough language since it implies that the

**Commentaire [ASB11]:** I suggest accountable here as we used this concept at the beginning

measures at the earliest convenient time in order to allow the private sector to prepare for consultations	measures at the earliest convenient time in order to allow the private sector to prepare for consultations as well as <b>the establishment of mechanisms to allow easy access to information on trade facilitation matters and legislative measures;</b>			sender has a responsibility to see to that the receiver actually access the information. The new text does not add meaning.
<b>the sharing of information on trade facilitation matters and legislative measures at the earliest convenient time in order to allow the private sector to prepare for consultations</b>	<b>the sharing of information on the consultation process at the earliest convenient time in order to allow the private sector to prepare for consultations</b>	BV	<b>the sharing of information on both process and content at the earliest convenient time in order to allow the private sector to prepare for consultations</b> This includes trade facilitation matters and suggested legislative measures.	The two notions need to be there – both process and content!
<b>the consistent discussion and coordination of policy with all stakeholders that will help governments and organizations to prioritize agendas and communicate results.</b>	<b>a continuous and inclusive process, allowing consistent discussion and coordination of policy with all stakeholders.</b>	BV	a continuous and inclusive process, allowing consistent discussions and coordination of policy with all stakeholders.	Accepted and amended. Part of the text moved to benefits.
<b>the establishment of mechanisms to allow easy access to information on trade facilitation matters and legislative measures.</b>	deletion	AS		I am reluctant to delete this given the importance of this issues in WTO and FTA negotiations

<b>See above</b>	<b>the establishment of mechanisms to allow easy access to information required for the participation in the consultation process, including information on any proposed rule and regulation as well as rulemaking docket.</b>	BV?		Legislative measures covers the proposed language on legal issues. Does “rulemaking docket” add something? The language on “information required to participate in consultation process” is more specific but does it help? To be discussed
<b>the timely notification of issues that trade would like government to consider prior to consultation</b>	<b>the timely notification of issues to consider prior to consultation;</b>	AS		Rejected This stresses that Trade has a role to play – important to keep highlighted trades need to actively prepare.
<b>See above</b>	deletion	BV		Reject not covered in C
<b>the consolidation by trade of its views prior to consultation with government, including detailing existing differences as between trade parties.</b>	we could add the consolidation of all public agencies of its views prior to consultation, as well?	AS		Accepted
New	<b>focus on performance measuring and monitoring to ensure positive results.</b>	BV	<b>focus on performance measuring and monitoring in order to achieve continuous improvement.</b>	Accepted with modification
New	<b>Invite involved stakeholders from both the private and public sector to adhere to the basic principles and procedures of</b>	BV		Is this not a bit redundant? The entire recommendation is just that. Covered in a.

**Commentaire [BV12]:** covered by c.

**Commentaire [BV13]:** There are studies available dealing with evaluation of consultative approaches. Rower & Frewer 2005, Austrian Standards for consultation.

	<b>consultation.</b>			
--	----------------------	--	--	--